



Thomas L. Colaluca, Chairman
Deborah Southerington, Commissioner
F. Allen Boseman, Commissioner

June 8, 2021

Cuyahoga County Council President Pernel Jones, Jr.
Chairwoman Shontel Brown,
Human Resources, Appointments and Equity Committee
Cuyahoga County Council
2079 E. 9th Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44115

Dear President Jones and Chairwoman Brown,

As part of the Personnel Review Commission's Charter responsibility to ensure an employment system based on merit and fitness, the PRC submits the attached 2020 Temporary Work Level (TWL) Report with Addenda which includes supporting documentation. This report reflects our continued efforts to ensure that the County complies with its TWL policy and that persons appointed to classified positions meet minimum qualifications for those positions.

The County's TWL policy (Section 9.05 of the Employee Handbook) allows the County to temporarily appoint an employee to a position with a higher pay range for a period of at least two weeks, but not more than one year. The employee must meet the minimum qualifications of the TWL position and should receive a minimum salary increase of 5% for the duration of the TWL.

The review was based on data from the County Executive's Personnel Agendas, SAP, position postings, classification specifications, resumes and applications. Julia McNulty, the County's Talent Acquisition Manager, was extremely helpful in providing additional information necessary for us to complete the audit.

While the County was generally successful in applying this policy, there were significant problems with

- 1) multiple appointments that exceeded the 365-day limit, and
- 2) the County's recordkeeping systems contained insufficient information to complete the audit.

While the County continues its efforts to implement modules in the new ERP system, we would strongly encourage the County's Human Resources department to ensure data entered into its recordkeeping system is detailed and accurate, so as to create a thorough record of each personnel action taken during County employment and to allow for efficient auditing of employment actions.

Please, if you have any questions, feel free to contact me directly at 216.443.5675.

Respectfully,

Rebecca Kopcienski
Rebecca Kopcienski, Director
Personnel Review Commission

Attachment

Cuyahoga County Personnel Review Commission
9830 Lorain Avenue • Cleveland, Ohio 44102 • 216.698.2290 • Fax 216.443.3694
prc.cuyahogacounty.us

cc: Councilman Michael J. Gallagher, Vice-Chair
Councilman Dale Miller, Member, HR, A & E Committee
Councilwoman Yvonne Conwell, Member, HR, A & E Committee
Councilman Martin Sweeney, Member, HR, A & E Committee
Councilwoman Nan Baker
Councilman Jack Schron
Councilwoman Sunny Simon
Councilwoman Cheryl Stephens
Councilman Scott Tuma
County Council Chief of Staff Joseph Nanni
County Council Clerk Andria Richardson
PRC Chairman Thomas Colaluca
PRC Commissioners F. Allen Boseman
PRC Commissioner Debbie Southerington
Director of Human Resources Jesse Drucker
Manager of Talent Acquisition Julie McNulty



2020

**TEMPORARY WORK LEVEL REPORT AND
QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW**

**Cuyahoga County
Personnel Review Commission**

Introduction

Cuyahoga County Charter Article IX, Section 9.02 sets forth various responsibilities for the Personnel Review Commission (PRC), one of which is reviewing and auditing compliance with federal, state, and local laws regarding personnel matters within the County Executive's organization and departments. The PRC prepared this report to assess compliance with the civil service laws of the County, the Ohio Revised Code, and the State of Ohio Constitution regarding Temporary Work Level appointments. A fundamental requirement of these laws is that appointments in the civil service of the County shall be made according to merit and fitness, to be ascertained as far as practicable by competitive examinations. The PRC is responsible for ensuring persons appointed to positions at the County meet the minimum qualifications for the position. For full-time civil service appointments, these persons are typically subjected to assessment procedures by the PRC to ascertain their qualifications for such positions. In the case of TWLs, these assessments of qualifications are made by the County's Human Resources department.

This compliance audit was focused on employees who were appointed to temporary work level assignments (TWLs) or whose TWLs ended in 2020 pursuant to the County's TWL policy stated in Section 9.05 of the Cuyahoga County Employee Handbook. The purpose of this audit is to ensure that the County complied with the TWL policy relative to the duration employees/applicants served in the TWL, whether they received pay increases, and whether they were qualified for the TWL position.

The PRC acknowledges the assistance of Julie McNulty, the County's interim Talent Acquisition & Employment Manager, who was extremely helpful in researching and resolving issues raised by the PRC during the compliance audit. Ms. McNulty was in a TWL during the time this report was being prepared, and she was able to gather information regarding actions that happened under the prior management of the HR department.

This report, as well as the raw data that accompanies it, will be posted on the PRC's website at <http://prc.cuyahogacounty.us/en-US/Compliance.aspx>.

Background

The TWLs addressed in this report were governed by Section 9.05 of the Cuyahoga County Employee Handbook. The Policy states, in relevant part:

"A temporary work level (TWL) may be granted when an employee is temporarily assigned 50% or more of the duties of a position with a higher pay range for a minimum of a two (2) week period, but not to exceed one (1) year.

The employee must meet the minimum qualifications for the position in the higher pay range to be granted a TWL. An employee who is granted a TWL will be placed

on a step that reflects at least a 5% increase in his or her salary, or the lowest step in the higher pay range, whichever is greater.

A supervisor must consult, in advance, with Human Resources regarding a TWL. Human Resources will review [the] TWL and makes [*sic*] a recommendation to the County Executive for final approval.”

Objective and Methodology

To prepare this report and provide County Council with a summary of the County’s compliance with the TWL Policy, the PRC reviewed the following data sources:

- County Executive’s Personnel Agendas (2020) received from Human Resources
- SAP
- INFOR
- Position postings, classification specifications, resumes, and/or applications
- Minimum qualifications of TWL positions
- TWL confirmation memoranda from HR

In this report, the PRC assesses the County’s compliance with the duration, pay, and qualifications requirements of the TWL Policy. This Report reviews TWLs that began or ended in 2020.

The Department of Human Resources provided responses to issues identified by the PRC. Those responses are included in each section below.

Concerns and Comments:

The PRC’s TWL audit relies heavily on information from the Human Resources department as it is the entity responsible for determining when the TWL is needed, potential eligible candidates for the TWL, and who ultimately receives the TWL appointment. Currently, the PRC has access to the County’s Talent Acquisition module, part of the INFOR ERP system, which includes applications (generally scant information included) and resumes from recent applicants. (The Talent Acquisition module has been operational for approximately two years.) The PRC has limited access to the County’s employment recordkeeping system, SAP, and at this point, it has not yet received access or training on the County’s new Global Human Resources component of the INFOR ERP system. (This system is eventually intended to replace SAP.) Thus, the PRC has some limitations in what information it can access to audit the TWL appointments.

The TWL appointments are important components of an employee’s life cycle; they often occur before promotions, and they are intended to accompany a pay increase for the duration of the TWL. In many cases, the PRC found that the County’s records in the SAP system are incomplete. There is often little or no information included to explain the position the employee previously held, the organizational location of the TWL, the length of the TWL, and the accompanying pay change. Sometimes, the system includes pieces of this information, and the PRC needs to reconstruct the employment record to connect all the dots, so to speak.

While the TWL report is a relatively small-scale audit report, the implications of the lack of effective recordkeeping are important. At a time when many organizations are closely examining equity issues on many fronts, the County's lack of recordkeeping regarding employment history and corresponding pay increases is a red flag of sorts, indicating a potential problem if the County needs to illustrate, explain, or at worse, defend its pay practices.

Another concern identified in the TWL report is the notation in four (4) instances that the County's Talent Acquisition Manager approved the extension of TWLs beyond the 365-day limit. The County's TWL policy is included in the County's Employee Handbook, the opening of which includes the following language:

The procedural guidelines covered in this handbook do not diminish the County's management rights and should not be considered a waiver of these rights. Unless limited or prohibited in this handbook, or otherwise restricted by law, the County reserves all rights to manage its workforce. The policies and procedural guidelines contained in this handbook are intended to promote equity, consistency, and standardization of benefits, but do not reflect or represent every conceivable situation but addresses those that are often encountered. Situations may differ and will be handled on a case-by-case basis, at the discretion of the County as permitted by applicable law. Whenever this discretion is used to justify a managerial decision by the County, such action will be logged by Human Resources.

The TWL policy includes a clear limitation; it should last no longer than 365 days. If exceptions to that standard are permitted, the PRC recommends approvals for those decisions by the Department Director, to avoid inconsistencies and potential appearances of unfairness in the application of the policy. Corresponding data entries should reflect this as well.

The County is in the process of implementing a \$30 million enterprise-wide resource planning system which includes several components for HR administration. It is critical that records entered in the new system are thorough, complete, and compliant. The PRC strongly recommends that HR department personnel who are responsible for entering data into these systems be trained thoroughly on the criticality of good employment recordkeeping, and that further quality control standards be implemented in the operation. Failure to do so puts the County at potential risk in the event its employment records come into question by employees, management, and outside interested parties.

Summary Conclusion

In 2020, twenty-six (26) employees served in Temporary Work Levels in 2020; thirteen (13) of these TWLS and thirteen (13) began. Of the TWLs ending in 2020, the PRC determined that 70 % met the duration requirement. Of all 2020 TWLs (ended and current), 100% met the salary adjustment requirement, 81% met the minimum qualifications for the TWL positions, and .01% (1 employee) likely met the minimum qualifications for the TWL position. Specifically, four (4)

employees exceeded the one-year time limit for the TWL, five (5) employees did not meet the minimum requirements for the position, and one (1) employee likely met the minimum qualifications for the position.

The PRC requested additional information from Human Resources for several employees because the PRC either did not have access to information necessary to confirm compliance with the TWL policy, necessary information was not provided on the Personnel Agendas, the position was unclassified, or an explanation from HR was required. The Department of Human Resources ("HR") provided responses to the issues the PRC identified. HR's responses are included in each section below.

COMPLIANCE REPORT

A. TWL DURATION

The PRC identified four (4) instances where the employee served in a TWL beyond the one-year time limit.

Issue: Patrick Saulters remained in his TWL of Administrator, Social Program Administrator 2 in Health and Human Services for 370 days. He was placed in the TWL on July 15, 2019, and it ended on July 19, 2020. The required end date of the TWL was July 13, 2020. This TWL exceeded the one-year limitation of the Policy.

HR Response: The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, and it was deemed an essential Leadership role.

Issue: Bernice Tucker remained in her TWL of Senior Supervisor, Mail Room in the Department of Public Works for 440 days. She was placed in the TWL on June 17, 2019, and it ended on August 30, 2020. The required end date of the TWL was June 15, 2020. This TWL exceeded the one-year limitation of the Policy.

HR Response: The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, and it was deemed an essential Leadership role.

Issue: Nicole Wilson remained in her TWL of Supervisor, Employment & Family Services in Health and Human Services for 552 days. She was placed in the TWL on March 11, 2019, and it ended on September 13, 2020. The required end date of the TWL was March 9, 2020. This TWL has exceeded the one-year limitation of the Policy.

HR Response: The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, and it was deemed an essential Leadership role.

Issue: Nichole English remained in her TWL of Section Chief, Engineering in the Department of Public Works for 377 days. She was placed in the TWL on October 21, 2019, and it ended on November 1, 2020. The required end date of the TWL was October 19, 2020. This TWL has exceeded the one-year limitation of the Policy.

HR Response: The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, and it was deemed an essential Leadership role.

B. PAY INCREASE COMMENSURATE WITH TWL

The PRC determined that all twenty-six (26) employees who served or are currently serving in TWLs were placed on a step that reflects at least a 5% increase in their salaries. This complies with the TWL policy.

C. EMPLOYEES WHO MEET MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS

The PRC determined that nineteen (19) employees who served or are currently serving in TWLs met or meet the minimum qualifications for the classification. These employees are identified in Addendum A to this Report, which is the 2020 Temporary Working Level Report spreadsheet and in Addendum B, which is the 2020 Minimum Qualifications Summary spreadsheet.

D. EMPLOYEES WHO DO NOT MEET MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS

The PRC determined that five (5) employees who served or are currently in the TWLs listed below did not meet the minimum qualifications for the position.

Fiscal Specialist 3 in the Fiscal Office

The minimum qualifications require a bachelor's degree in accounting, business administration, finance, or related field with three (3) years of accounting, finance, or budget management experience or any equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.

PRC Determination: Mary Thomas served a TWL in this position from January 20, 2020, through October 31, 2020. The PRC determined that she met the experience requirement of the position, but not the education requirement. The PRC determined that Ms. Thomas' associate's degree in computer science was not an equivalent education requirement.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request for HR's criteria for allowing this TWL, HR stated: "She is pursuing a bachelor's and has 3 years of business course work, she has 21 months as a senior account clerk, 29 months as accounting technician with the fiscal department, which totals 4.1 years. She has an additional 4 years of relevant experience in billing/customer service."

PRC Response: Because Ms. Thomas has not completed her bachelor's degree, she does not the minimum education qualification.

Accountant 2 in the Development Department

The minimum qualifications require a bachelor's degree in accounting or related field with two (2) years of experience in accounting or a related field, or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.

PRC Determination: Nikesha Bell is currently serving a TWL in this position effective August 17, 2020. The PRC determined that Ms. Bell meets the minimum experience requirement but not the education requirement. The PRC has not determined education equivalencies.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request for HR's criteria for allowing this TWL, HR replied: "Review resume to confirm equivalencies with the department."

PRC Response: Ms. Bell does not meet the minimum education requirement.

Manager, Investigation in HHS

The minimum qualifications require a bachelor's degree in business, finance, law, criminal justice, or related field with five (5) years of criminal or administrative investigative experience including two (2) years of supervisory experience, or any equivalent combination of training and experience, a valid Ohio driver's license, proof of automobile insurance, and a reliable vehicle.

PRC Determination: Amanda Jones is currently serving a TWL in this position effective September 14, 2020. The PRC has not determined educational equivalencies and Ms. Jones' bachelor's degree in human resources management and associate's degree in art do not meet the minimum qualifications. Because the PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance, HR confirmed that Ms. Jones has a valid Ohio driver's license, proof of automobile insurance, and a reliable vehicle.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request seeking HR's determination of an education equivalency, HR replied: "Bachelor's in HR is equivalent education."

PRC Response: HR did not provide documentation to support its position that a bachelor's degree in HR meets the education requirement, and the PRC has not determined educational equivalencies.

Manager, Tax Assessment in the Fiscal Office

The minimum qualifications require a bachelor's degree in business, accounting, computer science, or a related field with five (5) years of experience in accounting, tax collections, or related experience, or any equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.

PRC Determination: Robin Pitts-Lynch is currently serving a TWL in this position effective November 23, 2020. The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in any field meets the education requirement. The PRC cannot determine whether Ms. Pitts-Lynch employee meets the minimum experience requirement because it is unable to determine what job duties she performed as a Clerk.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request for a description of Ms. Pitts-Lynch's job duties as a clerk, HR provided a narrative of her job duties which is reflected on the 2020 Minimum Qualifications Summary spreadsheet.

PRC Response: HR did not provide supporting documentation. The PRC obtained a now inactive position description for Clerk and the job duties differ from HR's description. Based on the job duties stated in the inactive job description for Clerk, Ms. Pitts-Lynch does not meet the experience minimum qualification.

Supervisor, Case Control in HHS (PEI)

The minimum qualifications require a bachelor's degree in social science or related field with five (5) years of program eligibility or quality assurance experience including three (3) years of supervisory experience or any equivalent combination of training and experience.

PRC Determination: Lawren Maxwell is currently serving a TWL in this position effective December 14, 2020. The PRC determined that Ms. Maxwell meets the minimum education requirement but not the experience requirement.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request for HR's criteria regarding the minimum qualifications of this position, HR responded: "Education equivalencies and experience equivalencies for master's degree."

PRC Response: HR did not provide documentation of its determination. Ms. Maxwell does not meet the minimum qualifications. Post-note: The PRC revised the minimum qualifications in January 2021 (after this TWL began), and when Ms. Maxwell tested for this position on April 8, 2021, she met the minimum qualifications.

E. ONE EMPLOYEE LIKELY MEETS MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS

Administrator, Social Program 4

The minimum requirement for this position requires a bachelor's degree in social work with six (6) years of social work experience or any equivalent combination of training and experience.

PRC Determination: Daniel Humphrey is currently serving a TWL in this position effective December 21, 2020. The PRC determined Mr. Humphrey meets the minimum education requirement. The PRC is unable to independently verify how long Mr. Humphrey has been in the Program Officer 4 position in HHS or what his job duties are. The PRC does not have access to Mr. Humphrey's full employment history and is unable to determine whether he meets the experience requirement.

HR Position: In response to the PRC's request for HR's criteria regarding the minimum qualifications of this position, HR responded: "Resume review showing that Daniel meets the minimum qualifications for the administrator, social program 4 classification." HR provided a copy of Mr. Humphrey's resume supporting the TWL.

PRC Response: Mr. Humphrey's resume in the PRC's records and the one HR provided are one in the same and it does not establish that he meets minimum qualifications. However, based on the PRC's knowledge of the job duties of a Program Officer 4 in HHS, it is likely that Mr. Humphrey meets the minimum qualifications. But without documentation, the PRC cannot conclude that he does.

F. INCORRECT DATA PROVIDED TO THE PRC

Issue: The June 30, 2020, Personnel Agenda listed a TWL for Suzanne Paulk in the position of Program Officer 4 in Health & Human Services. However, while conducting the audit, HR informed the PRC that Ms. Paulk's TWL is in HR and that she meets the minimum qualifications for the TWL. The PRC independently determined that Ms. Paulk meets the minimum qualifications.

Issue: The August 1, 2020, Personnel Agenda listed the end of a TWL for Gloria Miller in the position of Employment and Family Services Specialist in Health and Human Services. However, while conducting the audit, the PRC determined that Ms. Miller's TWL was in the position of Supervisor, Employment and Family Services, and that the Personnel Agenda interposed the "from" and "to" positions.

Addendum A - 2020 TWL Policy Compliance Details

No.	Employee Name	Start Date	Required End Date	Actual End Date	Duration	Meets Min Quals	Pay Increase	Classification From	Appointing Authority	Classification To	Appointing Authority	Notes
1	Kovi, Jennifer	03/02/20	03/01/21	10/25/20	237	Y	Y	Social Service Supervisor	Health & Human Services	Clinical Coordinator	Health & Human Services	The PRC obtained the TWL end date of 10/25/2020 from SAP as it was not provided on the Personnel Agenda. The PRC typically does not maintain driver's license and proof of automobile insurance information. At the PRC's request, HR confirmed this employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.
2	Mines, Desiree	02/03/20	02/01/21	07/19/20	181	Y	Y	Employment & Family Service Specialist	Health & Human Services	Employment & Family Service Supervisor	Health & Human Services (DCFS)	The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in any field meets the minimum education qualification for this position. This employee has a bachelor's degree.
3	Thomas, Mary	01/20/20	01/18/21	10/31/20	285	N	Y	Accounting Technician	Fiscal Office	Fiscal Specialist 3	Fiscal Office	The PRC determined that this employee met the minimum experience requirement but not the education requirement. HR's criteria for approving the TWL is: "She is pursuing a bachelors and has 3 years of business course work, she has 21 months as a senior account clerk, 29 months as accounting technician w/ the fiscal department, which totals 4.1 years. She has an additional 4 years of relevant experience in billing/customer service." The PRC determined that the employee's degree in computer science does not meet the education requirement.
4	Woods, Holly	01/27/20	01/25/21	05/22/20	116	Y	Y	Director, HR Benefits & Compensation	Human Resources	Chief Human Resources Officer	Human Resources	The PRC obtained the TWL end date of 5/22/2020 from SAP as it was not provided on the Personnel Agenda.
5	Chambers, Michael	10/19/19	10/17/20	02/10/20	114	Y	Y	Operations & Finance Administrator	Fiscal	Chief Fiscal Officer	Public Works	
6	Paulk, Suzanne	06/22/20	06/21/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Program Officer 3	Health & Human Services	Program Officer 4	Health & Human Services	HR informed the PRC that the Personnel Agenda identified the incorrect Appointing Authority for the TWL and that the correct appointing authority is Human Resources.
7	Miller, Gloria	10/28/19	10/26/20	07/27/20	273	Y	Y	Employment & Family Services Spec.	Health & Human Services	Supervisor, Employment & Family Serv.	Health & Human Services (DCFS)	The PRC obtained the TWL start date of 10/28/2019 from SAP as it was not provided on the Personnel Agenda. Upon the PRC's request, HR advised that this TWL is in the DCFS division of HHS, as this was not provided on the Personnel Agenda.
8	Sauters, Patrick	07/15/19	07/13/20	07/19/20	370	Y	Y	Supervisor, Employment & Family Serv.	Health & Human Services	Administrator, Social Program Admin. 2	Development	The PRC obtained the TWL start date of 7/15/2019 from SAP as it was not provided on the Personnel Agenda. This TWL exceeded the one-year time limit. HR states the violation occurred because: "The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, it was deemed an essential Leadership role."
9	Bell, Nikesha N.	08/17/20	08/16/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	N	Y	Account Clerk	Development	Accountant 2	Fiscal	The PRC determined that this employee meets the minimum experience requirement but not the education requirement. The PRC has not determined educational equivalencies. HR's criteria for approving the TWL is: "Review resume to confirm equivalencies with the department."
10	Sanders, Nicole	08/03/20	08/02/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Deputy Dog Warden	Public Works	Supervisor, Fiscal Office	Human Resources	
11	Olinek, Ryan	08/05/19	08/03/20	08/04/20	365	Y	Y	Environmental Compliance Coordinator	Human Resources	Manager, Environmental Health & Safety (EHS)	Justice Services	
12	Kozub, Chris	09/16/19	09/14/20	08/30/20	349	Y	Y	Deputy Sheriff Sergeant	Justice Services	Deputy Sheriff, Lieutenant	Public Works	HR provided a copy of the Position Description for the TWL and other supporting documents. HR provided a narrative regarding the education and experience requirements. The PRC is not able to assess these requirements, so it defers to HR and the Sheriff's department management regarding their assessment of this employee's qualifications for the position. He has been a Sheriff's Department employee since 2007; it is likely that he possesses the necessary KSAs but the PRC is not able to confirm this.
13	Tucker, Bernice	06/17/19	06/15/20	08/30/20	440	Y	Y	Supervisor, Mail Room	Public Works	Senior Supervisor, Mail Room	Health & Human Services	This TWL exceeded the one-year time limit. HR states the violation occurred because: "The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, it was deemed an essential Leadership role." The PRC typically does not maintain driver's license and proof of automobile insurance. At the PRC's request, HR confirmed this employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.
14	Jones, Amanda B.	09/14/20	09/13/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	N	Y	Administrator, Social Program 2	Health & Human Services	Manager, Investigations	Health & Human Services (CJFS)	The PRC has not determined educational equivalencies. In response to the PRC's request, HR stated that a bachelor's degree in HR is an equivalent education qualification; however, HR did not provide documentation supporting this statement. The PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance. HR confirmed that the employee has a valid DL, proof of automobile insurance, and a reliable vehicle.

Addendum A - 2020 TWL Policy Compliance Details

15	Perez-Stable, Alfredo	09/28/20	09/27/21	03/27/21	180	Y	Y	Senior Training Officer Bargaining - HHS-AD	Health & Human Services	Supervisor, Training Officer	Health & Human Services (CJFS)	The PRC determined that this employee meets the minimum experience requirement and that his Bachelor's degree in English is an educational equivalent. HR confirmed this employee's TWL was in the CJFS division of HHS as this information was not provided on the Personnel Agenda.
16	Wilson, Nicole	03/11/19	03/09/20	09/13/20	552	Y	Y	Supervisor, Employment & Family Serv.	Health & Human Services	Sr. Supervisor, Emp. & Family Serv.	Fiscal	This TWL exceeded the one-year time limit. HR states the violation occurred because: "The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, it was deemed an essential Leadership role." The PRC determine that the employee's bachelor's degree in Public Relations meets the education requirement. HR confirmed the TWL was in the CJFS division of HHS as this information was not provided on the Personnel Agenda.
17	Friedlander, Joseph	10/12/20	10/11/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Administrative Clerk	Fiscal	Supervisor, Map Room	Fiscal	
18	Caraballo, Annette	11/23/20	11/22/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Admin. Asst. 2 - Bargaining FISC BOR	Fiscal	Supervisor, Fiscal Office	Fiscal	The PRC determined that this employee's associate's degree in business management meets the education requirement and that supervisory experience of any length in any form meets the experience requirement.
19	Pitts-Lynch, Robin	11/23/20	11/22/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	N	Y	Supervisor, Fiscal Office	Fiscal Office	Manager, Tax Assessment	Public Works	The PRC determined that this employee's bachelor's degree meets the education requirement. The PRC cannot determine whether this employee meets the minimum experience requirement because it is unable to determine what job duties she performed in her prior position of Clerk. HR provided a narrative regarding her Clerk job duties but did not provide supporting documentation. The PRC obtained the now non-active position description for Clerk and the job duties differ from HR's description.
20	English, Nichole	10/21/19	10/19/20	11/01/20	377	Y	Y	Administrator, Planning & Program	Public Works	Section Chief, Engineering	Health & Human Services (CJFS)	The PRC obtained the TWL start date of 10/21/2019 from SAP as it was not provided on the Personnel Agenda. This TWL exceeded the one-year time limit. HR states the violation occurred because: "The Talent Manager approved the extension as this position was on hold due to the pandemic and hiring freeze, it was deemed an essential Leadership role." The PRC typically does not maintain driver's license and proof of automobile insurance information. At the PRC's request, HR confirmed this employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.
21	Houchins, Freda	12/14/20	12/13/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Contract Analyst	Health & Human Services	Senior Administrative Officer	Health & Human Serv. (HHS-CAP)	HR confirms this employee's TWL is in the CJFS division of HHS as this information was not provided on the Personnel Agenda.
22	Humphrey, Daniel F.	12/21/20	12/20/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Likely meets min. quals. but need additional information.	Y	Program Officer 4	Health & Human Services	Administrator, Social Program 4	Health & Human Services	The PRC determined that this employee meets the minimum education requirement but cannot determine if he meets the experience requirement. The PRC does not have access to his full employment history and cannot independently verify how long he was a Program Officer 4. In response to the PRC's request for HR's criteria in granting the TWL, HR responded: "Resume review showing that Daniel meets the minimum qualifications for the administrator, social program 4 classification." Based on the PRC's knowledge of the job duties of a Program Officer 4 in HHS, it is likely that he meets this minimum qualifications.
23	Maxwell, Lawren	12/14/20	12/13/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	N	Y	Case Control Reviewer	Health & Human Services	Supervisor, Case Control	Human Resources	The PRC determined that this employee did not meet the minimum qualifications at the time of the TWL. Post-note: In January 2021, the PRC revised the minimum qualifications and this employee met them when she tested for the TWL position on April 8, 2021.
24	Gill, Angeline	12/07/20	12/06/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Program Officer 4	Human Resources	HRIS Administrator	Justice Services	Upon request, HR confirmed that HRIS Administrator is the proper classification.

Addendum A - 2020 TWL Policy Compliance Details

25	Fovozzo, Thomas	12/08/20	12/07/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Security Sergeant	Justice Services	Security Lieutenant	Justice Services	
26	Hayes, Jacqueline	12/14/20	12/13/21	Current TWL	Current TWL	Y	Y	Legal Account Clerk 3	Justice Services	Senior Administrative Assistant		

Addendum B - Minimum Qualifications 2020 TWL Details

No.	Employee	TWL Position/Department & Position Requirements	EMPLOYEE'S EDUCATIONAL BACKGROUND	EMPLOYEE'S RELEVANT EXPERIENCE AND PROFESSIONAL LICENSURE DETAILS	Meets Minimum Qualifications?	Additional Information	Source of Employee Information
1	Kovi, Jennifer	Clinical Coordinator in HHS: Master's degree in social work, clinical counseling, psychology or related field with three (3) years of social work or counseling experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience. Must be an Ohio Licensed Social Worker. Need valid driver's license and proof of automobile insurance.	Master's - Social Administration; Bachelor's - Criminal Justice; Associate's - Private Investigations	10.42 yrs as Child Protection Specialist at Cuyahoga County Division of Children & Family Services; Experience in intake/short term services and ongoing case management. Ensures protection and nurturing of at-risk children through assessment of referrals to the CCDCFS 24-hour hotline by engaging families to address concerns. National Child Welfare Workforce Institute "Think, Relate, Coach"-Change Initiative; Leadership Seminar Series Cohort 1. <u>Licensed Social Worker</u>	Y	The PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance. HR confirmed the employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
2	Mines, Desiree	Employment and Family Services Supervisor in HHS (DCFS): Bachelor's degree in social work, business administration, or a related field, and one year of eligibility determination experience.	Bachelor's - Specialization not provided	12.42 yrs as Employment and Family Service Specialist in HHS, Division of CJFS, at Cuyahoga County: Determines initial and continued eligibility for Title IV-E Foster Care, Adoption Assistance and Medicaid program. Obtains necessary verifications, documentation, and information to determine eligibility.	Y	The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in any field meets the minimum education qualification.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
3	Thomas, Mary	Fiscal Specialist 3 in the Fiscal Office: Bachelor's degree in accounting, business administration, finance, or related field with three (3) years of accounting, finance, or budget management experience; or any equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Associate's - Computer Science	1.83 yrs as Account Technician at Cuyahoga County: Processes payments; schedules check runs and direct deposits; cancels checks and updates payment sources; balances deposits; prepares/audits court fee bills; submits reports to the State of Ohio; Team Lead; processes vouchers for payments; organizes and completes contract encumbrances and amendments; maintains vendor files; proficient with Famis, Onbase and Outlook, Word, and Excel; organizes and distributes monthly reports; notarizes documents; and processes escrow payments and delivered them to treasury services. 1.25 yrs as Senior Account Clerk at Cuyahoga County: Processed payments; organized and completed contract encumbrances and amendments; maintained vendor files; prepared and audited court fee bills; served as lead worker; vendor coded and audited vouchers; balanced revenue when needed and issued daily reports; and processed escrow payments and delivered them to treasury services.	N	Meets the experience requirement. The PRC determined that a degree in Computer Science does not meet the education requirement. HR's criteria for permitting the TWL is: "She is pursuing a bachelors and has 3 years of business course work, she has 21 months as a senior account clerk, 29 months as accounting technician with the fiscal department, which totals 4.1 years. She has an additional 4 years of relevant experience in billing/customer service."	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
4	Woods, Holly	Chief Human Resources Officer in Human Resources: Bachelor's degree, preferably in human resources management, organizational management, labor relations, or business management. Ten (10) years of senior leadership experience in human resources spanning a variety of HR functions including talent acquisition, compensation and benefits, training and development, and labor relations. Demonstrates competencies in organizational savvy, decision making, fostering communication, improving business processes, thinking strategically, and visioning and alignment.	Bachelor's - Human Resources Management & Management Information Systems	3.08 yrs as Director of HR, Benefits & Compensation at Cuyahoga County: Planned, designed, communicated and administered the organization's employee benefits, unclassified compensation plan and programs, wellness programs, policies, objectives, and initiatives. Developed and administered unclassified compensation and organization benefits programs designed to attract and retain high quality employees. Ensured unclassified compensation and organizational benefits programs remained within budgetary constraints. Aligned programs and policies with organizational initiatives, strategic objectives, and legal requirements, among other duties. 7.08 yrs as HR Mgr/ Mgr Employee & Labor Relations at Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District: Collaborated with departmental and organizational leaders to lead the integration, alignment, and implementation of key HR initiatives including leave management and employee and labor relations. Planned, oversaw, implemented, and evaluated employee and labor relations policies, processes, and practices. Managed the administration and ongoing improvement of occupational health, worker's compensation services, and leave management. Evaluated, developed strategy, and recommended new services, processes, and procedures to improve efficiency and support. Directly managed and led Employee & Labor Relations personnel. Served as acting HR Director and temp. Benefits Manager.	Y		Employee resume on INFOR or on a former application database.
5	Chambers, Michael	Chief Fiscal Officer in the Fiscal Office: Bachelor's degree with twelve (12) years of progressive experience in finance for a major nonprofit, governmental organization, or division of a large corporation. Experience working in a senior financial management role developing and implementing management strategies through multiple fiscal periods. Certified Public Accountant licensure.	Bachelor's - Business Administration	4 yrs as Senior Business Manager/Fiscal Officer at Cuyahoga County: Oversees and manages all financial activities of the department of Public Works including budget preparation, revenues, expenditure, accounts receivable, accounts payable, purchasing, prevailing wage, annual audit, and inventory control. Directly accountable for the department's \$100 million operating budget and its \$300 million capital plan. Routinely act as a liaison that meets with other county and municipal agencies regarding financial matters pertaining to the Department of Public Works. Approximately 11.33 years as Fiscal Officer at Cuyahoga County: Responsible for planning, controlling, organizing, and coordinating all financial activities of the County Engineer and the Sanitary Engineer divisions including budget preparation, payroll, accounts receivable, accounts payable, purchasing, prevailing wage, audit, inventory control, revenues, and expenditures. Directly accountable for the department's \$55 million operating budget and \$200 million capital plan. <u>Licensed Certified Public Accountant</u>	Y		Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
6	Paulk, Suzanne	Program Officer 4 in HR: Bachelor's degree in business administration or related field with six years of research and analysis experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience which provides equivalent knowledge, skills and abilities.	Bachelor's - Psychology; Master's - Public Administration	22.34 years as Program Officer 3 at Cuyahoga County: Creates and maintains databases and spreadsheets to facilitate human resource data analytics, including reported and projected personnel changes, allocation of FTEs, attrition rates, applicant screening, and organizational structure charts. Attends Step 2 Union Grievances, investigates and interviews front line supervisors and management, presents findings to Administrator. Facilitates project teams and provides technical assistance to design streamlined workflow processes resulting in improved customer service and accurate and timely eligibility determination. Assists senior management team in research and analysis to support change efforts. Interprets laws, rules, and regulations. Performs research and analysis, and reports on findings.	Y	The Personnel Agenda placed this TWL in HHS. HR advised the PRC that the correct department is HR.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
7	Miller, Gloria	Supervisor, Employment & Family Service in HHS (DCFS): Bachelor's degree in social work, business administration, or a related field, and one (1) year of eligibility determination experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Bachelor's - Specialization not provided	13.25 yrs as Health & Nutrition Specialist: Determines eligibility for the Title IV-E program. Calculates budgets used to determine client's eligibility for various programs. Entered Legal and Placement events in Sacwis along with determining eligibility for Juvenile Court custody cases.	Y	HR advised the PRC that this TWL is in the DCFS division of HHS, as it was not provided in the Personnel Agenda. Meets the education requirement. The PRC determined a high school diploma or GED and five years of experience meets the education requirement.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.

Addendum B - Minimum Qualifications 2020 TWL Details

8	Saulters, Patrick	Administrator, Social Program Administrator 2: Bachelor's degree in social work or related field and four years of social work experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Bachelor's - Urban Studies	Approximately 4 yrs as Eligibility Specialist: Processes applications for public benefits. Completed enrollments for work programs. Interprets federal and state regulations for public assistance. Effectively manages public assistance caseloads resulting in the determination of eligibility for OWF, PRC, SNAP and Medicaid.	Y		Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
9	Bell, Nikesha	Accountant 2 in Development: Bachelor's degree in accounting or related field with two (2) years of experience in accounting or a related field; or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Associate's - Accounting	14.25 yrs as Customer Service Manager: Accurately processes customer transactions, identifies and resolves discrepancies related to customer and internal bank accounts. Processes employee payroll to ensure timely/accurate payroll disbursements. Counts \$250k during monthly financial center cash audits for accuracy. Reviews financial center documents for proper procedural compliance, 98% accuracy. Authorized large cash withdrawals, deposits, and official checks up to \$250k. Integrated action plans to correct errors during monthly audits. Detected counterfeit bills and processed them according to bank guidelines.	N	Meets minimum experience requirement. The PRC has not determined equivalencies for the education requirement. HR's criteria for approving the TWL is: "Review resume to confirm equivalencies with the department."	Employee resume on INFOR or on a former application database.
10	Sanders, Nicole	Supervisor, Fiscal Office: Associate's degree in business, administration, accounting or related field with three (3) years of billing, real estate management, accounting; or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Associate's - Arts; Bachelor's Animal Sciences; Associate's Sciences	7 yrs as Deputy Dog Warden at Cuyahoga County Animal Shelter: Implemented a real estate program that allowed outreach to new community members to advise them of dog licensing requirements. Identified and managed a software program to perform a dog license census in the City of Lakewood. 1.67 yrs as Front Liner-Student Leader at OSU's Office for Disability Services: Provided daily customer service to students and faculty. Corresponded with professors and students to ensure student accommodations were met for exams.	Y	The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in an unrelated field and three (3) years of experience meets the education requirement, and general public contact such as correspondence via email, phone call, or in-person contact meets the experience requirement.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
11	Olinek, Ryan	Manager, Environmental Health & Safety in HR: Bachelor's degree in Environmental health, Occupational or Industrial Safety, or a closely related field. Five (5) years of progressively responsible experience in environmental health & safety where program implementation and policy development were major job responsibilities. Experience addressing occupational health concerns through workplace evaluation for biological, chemical, or physical hazards is required.	Bachelor's - Environmental, Safety and Occupational Health Management	1 yr as Environmental Compliance Coordinator at Cuyahoga County: Leads and assists Public Works facility projects and maintenance evaluations, develops scopes of work, guidance in processes, operating protocols, and raw material selection. Provides progress reports to facility management. Responds to complaints of suspected indoor environmental hazards. Assists in response to safety complaints. Delivers informed follow-up to clients and recommend path forward. Lead/assist facility and field EHS inspections. SME for various environmental and safety regulations in daily Cuyahoga County operations. 7.75 yrs as Field Enforcement Manager at Cleveland Division of Air Quality: Composed inspection schedule and monitored progress to ensure contract requirements were met. Developed and implemented office enforcement policies. Reviewed facility inspection reports and managed associated database maintenance and correspondence. Reviewed and maintained complaints database. Conducted/assisted on staff facility inspections. Determined compliance status. Initiated enforcement actions. Interpreted federal, state, and local air regulations.	Y		Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
12	Kozub, Chris	Deputy Sheriff Lieutenant in Justice Services: Minimum Acceptable Characteristics include knowledge of supervision and management, interviewing, and labor and public relations, and the ability to deal firmly but courteously with public, write concise and meaningful reports, and complete routine forms, among others.	(Per HR) High school diploma	(Per HR): "Graduated from Fairview HS, began employment with the CCSD on 08/13/2007 as a Deputy Sheriff (12+ years LE experience). Promoted to Sergeant on 11/16/2014 (4+ years as a LE supervisor experience). Sgt. Kozub attended and successfully completed OPOTA through Polaris Natural Resources Ranger Academy on 05/04/2007. Deputy Unit staff are required to maintain a valid State of Ohio Driver's License and proof of current automobile insurance."	Y	HR provided a copy of the Position Description which does not include specific education or experience requirements but instead includes a list of required knowledge, skills, and abilities. HR provided a copy of the employee's high school diploma, transcript of course work at Cuyahoga Community College, certification of Ohio Peace Officer Basic Training, and employment history at Cuyahoga County. HR provided a narrative regarding the education and experience requirements. The PRC is not able to assess these requirements, so it defers to HR and the Sheriff's department management regarding their assessment of his qualifications for the position. He has been a Sheriff's Department employee since 2007; it is likely that he possesses the necessary KSAs but the PRC is not able to confirm this.	HR reviewed the personnel file and SAP. HR provided the position description, the OPOTA credentials, the education records, and the work history.
13	Tucker, Bernice	Senior Supervisor, Mail Room in Public Works: High school diploma or equivalent with five (5) years of mail processing experience, including one (1) year as supervisor; or any equivalent combination of training and experience. Valid driver's license and proof of automobile insurance.	Bachelor's - Social Work	1 yr as Senior Mailroom Supervisor at Cuyahoga County: Covers mail rooms, routes, drive routes; schedules vacation time off, and hires staff. 17.25 yrs as Mailroom Supervisor at Cuyahoga County: Inspected work and post office pick ups; sat in for other supervisor; scheduled time off; processed mail, filing, picking up, and dropping off mail, scheduled drive routes and walked routes; scheduled pick-ups in buildings; and conducted clerk evaluations.	Y	The PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance. HR confirmed the employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
14	Jones, Amanda	Manager, Investigation in HHS: Bachelor's degree in business, finance, law, criminal justice, or related field with five (5) years of criminal or administrative investigative experience including two (2) years of supervisory experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience. Valid Ohio driver's license, proof of automobile insurance, and a reliable vehicle.	Bachelor's - Human Resources Management; Associate's - Art	3.92 yrs as Eligibility Supervisor at Lorain County JFS: Expertise in OBWP, SNAP, TANIF and Medicaid functionality in the OBWP system. 4.58 yrs as Eligibility Caseworker at Lorain County JFS: Determined eligibility for public eligibility for public benefits including SNAP, TANF, and Medicaid.	N	The PRC has not determined educational equivalencies. In response to the PRC's request, HR stated that a bachelor's degree in HR is an equivalent education qualification; however, HR did not provide documentation to support this statement. The PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance. HR confirmed that the employee has a valid DL, proof of automobile insurance, and a reliable vehicle.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.

Addendum B - Minimum Qualifications 2020 TWL Details

15	Perez-Stable, Alfredo	Supervisor, Training Officer in HHS (CJFS): Bachelor's degree in education or human resources with five (5) years of training experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Bachelor's - English	<p>2.92 yrs as Senior Training Officer at Cuyahoga County EFS: Developed, updated, maintained and implemented New Hire training materials for incoming EFS Specialists and served as lead trainer for both MAGI and ABD Medicaid, SNAP, IEVS and E-Verify, Non-Citizens, CRIS-E Systems and Final Activity Day. Developed and implemented Refresher Trainings for ongoing staff - including leading IEVS and E-Verify, MPAP, SNAP policy, Medicaid policy, AEMA and SNAP Certification Periods. Developed Desk Aids for use by both New Hire EFS Specialists and ongoing staff. Created both testing instruments and sample case scenarios for New Hire Orientation.</p> <p>4 yrs as Employment & Family Service Specialist at Cuyahoga County: Interviewed clients and determined eligibility for multiple program public assistance programs. Accurately entered customer data and compute budgets. Verified eligibility documentation. Notified participants of approval, denial or changes in assistance. Prepared routine correspondence. Developed and implemented OBWP presentations and demonstrations for V.E.B. All-Staff Meetings. Provided daily hands-on training to both Eligibility Specialists and Team Leads in OBWP processing.</p> <p>3 yrs as Office Manager/Inside Sales Representative at Greisser Sales Company, Inc.: Developed and delivered trainings for new office personnel.</p>	Y	HR confirms this employee's TWL is in the CJFS division of HHS. The PRC has determined that a bachelor's in English meets the education requirement.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
16	Wilson, Nicole	Senior Supervisor, Employment and Family Service in HHS (CJFS): Bachelor's degree in social work, business administration, or related field, and five (5) years of case management, human service program delivery or related experience including two (2) years of supervisory experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Bachelor's - Public Relations	<p>7.58 yrs as Self-Sufficiency Coach at Cuyahoga County: Determined eligibility for TANF, SNAP and Medicaid benefits.</p> <p>13 yrs as Employment and Family Service Supervisor at Cuyahoga County: Supervised a unit of case workers to ensure work completion and accuracy. Monitored payroll, time sheets, FMLA requests and discrepancies. Provided training to staff on current programs and policies. Provided conflict management for difficult employees.</p>	Y	HR confirms this employee's TWL is in the CJFS division of HHS. The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in Public Relations is an equivalent education requirement.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
17	Friedlander, Joseph	Supervisor, Map Room in the Fiscal Office: High school diploma and five (5) years of office administration experience including contact with the public or related experience; or any equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	High school diploma	8.92 yrs as Administrative Clerk at Cuyahoga County Fiscal Office: Handles transfer and recording of all real property documents. Files plat maps. Assists the public with information and filing questions. Handles reproduction of maps and documents. Assists engineers with plat map filing and approval.	Y		Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
18	Caraballo, Annette	Supervisor, Fiscal Office: Associate's degree in business, administration, accounting, or related field with three (3) years billing, real estate management, accounting; or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Associate's - Applied Business/Business Management - Small Business	13.67 yrs as Senior Supervisor/Project Leader: Structured, developed and implemented a project plan that included criteria, statistics, and schedules of completion. Trained and supervised from 15 to 35+ FTE's and 15 PTE's. Delegated and reviewed daily work assignments. Conducted performance evaluations. Documented disciplinary incidents and actions. Approved or disapproved timesheets in accordance to the needs of the department. Recommended and approved selection of new employees. Promoted employee morale by communicating and addressing questions and concerns and recognizing superior performance and efficiencies.	Y	The PRC determined that an associate's degree in business management meets the education requirement, and that supervisory experience of any length in any form/field meets the experience requirement.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
19	Pitts-Lynch, Robin	Manager, Tax Assessment in the Fiscal Office: Bachelor's degree in business, accounting, computer science, or a related field with five (5) years of experience in accounting, tax collections, or related experience; or any equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Bachelor's - Economics	<p>1.5 yrs as Fiscal Office Supervisor at Cuyahoga County: Provided administrative support to the Tax Assessment Administrator through research, auditing, and various tax related functions. Coordinated with vendors to produce mass mailings for Homestead and the publication of delinquent lands. Communicated with taxpayers, lawyers, various Fiscal Office staff to ensure accurate tax billing practices, and to resolve information requests, issues, and complaints. Organized supply requisitions and inventory, work orders, and technical support needs.</p> <p>1.75 yrs as Senior Account Clerk at Cuyahoga County: Calculated, processed, and verified tax refunds based on property value increases and decreases. Calculated, processed, and verified tax refunds based on Homestead Exemptions and Owner Occupancy. Processed Homestead Exemption Continuing and Confirming Applications. Assisted taxpayers with Homestead Exemption eligibility qualifications.</p> <p>2 yrs as a Clerk at Cuyahoga County: The position description for Clerk states: Prepares routine documents using typewriter or word processing equipment; prepares copies of documents using standard copier equipment; maintains filing system ; maintains supply storage for office; answers telephone and directs visitors; sends and receives facsimiles. Per HR, the employee performed "Clerical duties for the Auditors office: Prepares and processes routine financial documents and maintains accounts payable and/or receivable."</p> <p>.92 yrs as Administrative Assistant at Cuyahoga County: Processed property value and tax changes in accordance with Board of Revision/Appraisal decisions. Processed Treasurer Office requests for penalty and interest abatements. Calculated, processed, and verified Real Property, Homestead Exemption and Owner Occupancy refunds. Assisted taxpayers with questions and concerns regarding property values, taxes, and bills. Assisted taxpayers with Homestead Exemption eligibility qualifications.</p>	N	The PRC determined that a bachelor's degree in any field meets the education requirement. The PRC cannot determine whether this employee meets the minimum experience requirement because it is unable to determine what job duties she performed as a Clerk. HR provided a narrative regarding her Clerk job duties but did not provide supporting documentation. The PRC obtained the now non-active position description for Clerk and the job duties differ from HR's description.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.

Addendum B - Minimum Qualifications 2020 TWL Details

20	English, Nichole	<u>Administrator, Planning & Program in Public Works:</u> Bachelor's degree in Civil Engineering, Public Administration or related field; Master's degree preferred; with a minimum of ten (10) years of experience in project planning and administration. Licensed as a Professional Engineer with the State of Ohio. Valid driver's license. Five (5) years of managerial experience.	Master's - Transportation Engineering; Bachelor's - Civil Engineering	<p><u>5.75 yrs as Engineer IV at Cuyahoga County:</u> Manage project programming of Highway and Bridge projects including project selection, preparing legislation, RFQ development, and consultant selection and contracting. Assist Department Manager with planning and supervising operations of dept. and coordinating projects with other departments in Public Works and County. Serve as project manager on Downtown Cleveland Hilton hotel project including all consultant hiring, contracts and invoicing. Assist Director on project decision making.</p> <p><u>7.33 yrs as Transportation Planning Service Area Leader at HNTB Corporation:</u> Project Management - Managed range of projects from small studies to major interchange designs including budgets and schedules. Leadership - Managed planning department of up to 15 staff across Ohio offices; recruited, managed, and trained engineers and office staff; mentored assistant dept. manager. Business Development - Developed client relationships and led marketing efforts and strategic planning.</p> <p><u>Licensed Professional Engineer</u></p>	Y	The PRC does not typically maintain driver's license information and proof of automobile insurance. HR confirmed the employee has a valid DL and proof of automobile insurance.	Employee resume on INFOR or on a former application database.
21	Houchins, Freda	<u>Senior Administrative Officer in HHS (CJFS):</u> Bachelor's degree in business administration or related field with nine (9) years of administrative experience; or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience.	Bachelor's - Human Resource Development; Master's - Management	<u>8.33 yrs as Program Officer 3/Contract Analyst at Cuyahoga County:</u> Develops, produces, processes from concept development to completion RFPs, RFQs, contracts, agreements, and amendments for goods and/or social program services using the Matrix, OnBase, and the ERP Infor procurement systems. Researches, analyzes, and evaluates existing requests for proposals, contracts, agreements, and amendments to identify areas of improvement that complies with federal, state, and local regulations. Coordinates the work of staff converting contracts into the ERP Procurement System.	Y	HR confirms this employee's TWL is in the CJFS division of HHS as this was not provided on the Personnel Agenda. The PRC determined that a bachelor's and master's degree in any field meet the education requirement, that contract administration is relevant experience, and that, if the applicant possesses a Master's degree, only five (5) years of relevant experience is required instead of nine (9) years in HHS (CJFS).	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
22	Humphrey, Daniel F.	<u>Administrator, Social Program 4 in HHS (HHS-CAP):</u> Bachelor's degree in social work with six years of social work experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Master's - Social and Urban Policy; Bachelor's - History	<p><u>17 yrs as Government Innovation Fellow at Cuyahoga County:</u> Provide full-time technical assistance to JFS to help improve employee workforce outcomes. Expand use of results-based contracting in human services. Assistance includes analyzing operational and programmatic outcomes data, drafting RFPs, and developing/implementing new policies and operational practices. Provided technical assistance to HHS and JFS to improve workforce outcomes for participants in benefits and programs. Build and analyze datasets for reports and dashboards on operations and program outcomes. Evaluate JFS operations and policy to recommend and help implement improvements. Plan and draft RFPs for workforce service contracts for JFS programs.</p> <p><u>1.58 yrs as Performance Management & Operations Officer at Cuyahoga County:</u> Created and oversaw performance management system to aid policy and operations; conduct policy research to support criminal justice reform. Implemented performance management system for \$30M office of 350+ attorneys and staff. Used administrative data to improve case workflows, indictment times, jail utilization. Used data to advocate reform of bail practices to the Justice System Reform Board. Developed \$1.4M savings proposal for 2016-2017 budget based on indictment. Designed new Crime Strategies Unit after touring District Attorney's Offices across US.</p> <p><u>.58 yrs as Special Assistant at Cuyahoga County:</u> Implemented programs and conducted policy research in Services. Evaluated depart. performance measures for validity/suitability. Expanded research network and data collection for Lake Erie environmental quality initiative. Management representative on ERP.</p> <p><u>1.33 yrs as Program Officer 1:</u> Policy research for Communications Department and for the Executive Office in areas of economic development and regional collaboration. Authoring countywide three-year review of operations. Development and implementation of countywide Public Policy Records Request Management Tool.</p> <p><u>.5 yrs as Public Policy Fellow:</u> Long-term study on states' proposed Ohio Turnpike lease, involved self-directed research/composition. Economic Dev. Policy: Short term and on-going research topics; drafting official policy statements.</p>	Likely meets minimum requirements, but additional information is needed.	Meets minimum education requirement. The PRC cannot determine whether the employee meets the experience requirement as it is unable to independently verify how long he was in the Program Officer 4 position in HHS or what his job duties were. The PRC does not have access to the employee's full employment history. In response to the PRC's request to HR for its criteria in granting the TWL, HR responded: "Resume review showing that Daniel meets the minimum qualifications for the administrator, social program 4 classification." HR provided the employee's resume, and it is identical to the resume in the PRC's records. Based on the PRC's knowledge of the job duties of a Program Officer 4 in HHS, it is likely that the employee meets the minimum qualifications. However, without documentation, the PRC cannot conclude that he does.	Employee resume on INFOR or on a former application database.
23	Maxwell, Lawren	<u>Supervisor, Case Control in HHS (PEI):</u> Bachelor's degree in social science, or related field with five (5) years of program eligibility or quality assurance experience including three (3) years of supervisory experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Master's - Educational Leadership; Bachelor's - History & Integrated Social Studies Education	<p><u>1.33 yrs as Case Control Reviewer at Cuyahoga County:</u> Conducts quality assurance reviews of income maintenance cases to reduce the error rate of county public assistance programs. Reviews income maintenance case records, analyzes and evaluates case information to determine if corrective action is needed, and develops and implements corrective action plans as needed.</p> <p><u>2 yrs as EFS Specialist at Cuyahoga County:</u> Interviewed and determined eligibility for SNAP, Medicaid, and TANF programs; collected and entered data, computed budgets; verified eligibility documentation. Prepared and scanned documents to the case files including changes affecting eligibility; notified participants of changes in assistance or services.</p>	N	Does not meet the minimum qualifications at the time of the TWL. Post-note: In January 2021, the PRC revised the minimum qualifications and Ms. Maxwell met them when she tested for the TWL position on April 8, 2021.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.

Addendum B - Minimum Qualifications 2020 TWL Details

24	Gill, Angeline	HRIS Administrator in HR: Bachelor's Degree in computer information systems, software development, business administration, or applicable department field of expertise such as Public Works, Fiscal, Procurement or Human Resources with five (5) years of application support, report creation, workflow, and/or troubleshooting experience, including (2) years related to the applicable department's ERP core modules; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	Master's - Labor Relations and Human Resources; Bachelor's - Philosophy	<p>42 yrs as Program Officer 4 - HRIS at Cuyahoga County: Creates and updates Infor GHR structure, including jobs, organization units, management, reporting structure, and positions for all County agencies. Validates data to ensure data integrity, researches data quality issues. Extracts, manipulates, compiles, and interprets moderate to complex data using Infor GHR, SAP and other data sources. Collaborates with IT to build and test Tableau analytics options including HR Work Assignment dashboard (upgrades). Provides monthly HR Decentralized and Compensation metrics reports and maintains Compensation Metrics Access Database.</p> <p>3.75 yrs as Program Officer 4 HR Data Analytics Specialist at Cuyahoga County: Extracted, manipulated, compiled, and interpreted moderate to complex data using SAP, additional information systems, and other data sources. Collaborated with IT & Centralized HR employees to update SAP and SACWIS databases; updated and created positions within Infor GHR; updated employee leave data in Infor GHR; maintained supplemental HR database and agency structure charts; Maintained documentation of HR data requests. Lead and planned HR analytics projects. Designed, developed, and presented HR data reporting tools for use by managers, HR leadership team, and other stakeholders. Collaborated with IT to build and test Tableau analytics options – HR Work Assignment dashboard. Provided analytical support to the HR Leadership team in the planning of HR initiatives. Validated data to ensure data integrity, researched data quality issues.</p> <p>3 yrs as Special Projects Coordinator (SPA2) at Cuyahoga County: Designed, developed and maintained HR /exit interview Access databases, as well as related forms and reports to more effectively manage and track HR data. Provided detailed restructure information in the form of spreadsheets and visual charts to help facilitate HR and IT system updates. Developed strategies and related policy to improve the fairness and equity of the TWL (temporary work level) process. Designed and built a contracts management database.</p>	Y	HR confirms that the proper classification is HRIS Administrator.	Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
25	Fovozzo, Thomas	Security Lieutenant in Justice Services: High school diploma or equivalent with three (3) years of experience as a security officer or related experience plus two (2) years of experience at a supervisory level providing facility and personal security; or an equivalent combination of education, training, and experience. Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy (O.P.O.T.A. certification is required). Completion of firearms training or certification is required.	High school diploma	<p>8.25 yrs as Security Officer at Cuyahoga County: Monitor persons entering and exiting County Building while maintaining metal detectors and confiscating prohibited items. Detain persons when necessary. Conduct vehicle and foot patrols on County owned and leased property. Prepare and complete reports or logs related to security activities.</p> <p>21 yrs as Security Sergeant at Cuyahoga County: Building Sergeant in charge of the day to day operations under the employee's command. Conducted background checks for outside contractors using Open on Line Nationwide Universal Background Checks. Administrative Sergeant responsible for Departmental Scheduling, officer's leave, dept. payroll functions through SAP, MyHR and SIR Database. Conduct audits for accuracy on Departmental equipment.</p> <p><u>OPOTA certified and Firearms Training</u></p>	Y		Employee resume submitted to apply for the TWL position.
26	Hayes, Jacqueline	Senior Administrative Assistant in Justice Services: High school diploma and three (3) years of administrative support experience; or any equivalent combination of training and experience.	High school diploma	14.25 yrs as Legal Services Clerk: Manage and distribute paper work for Legal Service Clerks. Enter and update family and attorney information into computer (Jims and I-Case). Prepares terminals and printers for daily operation. Utilizes Juvenile Court information system to enter and retrieve court related data. Scanning/imaging.	Y		Employee resume on INFOR or on a former application database.